# OHNTED STATES OF THE PROTECTION

#### UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION 4 ATLANTA FEDERAL CENTER 61 FORSYTH STREET ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-8960

SEP 1 7 2009

**4APT-PTSB** 

## <u>CERTIFIED MAIL</u> RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

Vincent Alventosa, Senior Corporate and Regulatory Counsel Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc. 410 South Swing Road Greensboro, NC 27409-2080

SUBJ: Docket No. FIFRA-04-2009-9105(b)

Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc. (Self-Disclosure)

Dear Mr. Alventosa:

Enclosed is a copy of the ratified Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO) in the above-referenced matter. The original CAFO has been filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk and served on the parties as directed in Section 22.6 of the Consolidated Rules of Practice, 40 CFR Part 22.

As stated in Section V of the CAFO, the assessed penalty of \$31,200 is due within 30 days from the effective date. Please ensure that the face of your cashier's or certified check includes the name of the company name and docket number of this case.

Penalty payment questions should be directed to Ms. Lori Weidner either by telephone at (513) 487-2125 or by written correspondence to her attention at the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Cincinnati Accounting Operations address identified in the CAFO. Should you have any questions about your compliance status in the future, please call me at (404) 562-8979 or Ms. Cheryn Jones at (404) 562-9006.

Also enclosed is a copy of a document entitled "Notice of Securities and Exchange Commission's Environmental Duty to Disclose Environmental Proceedings." This document puts you on notice of your potential duty to disclose to the Securities and Exchange Commission (SEC) any environmental enforcement actions taken by the EPA.

Sincerely

Anthony G. Toney

Acting Chief

Pesticides and Toxic Substances Branch

Enclosures (2)

cc: Steven A. Herman, Esq. Beveridge & Diamond

Ms. Shannon Joyner North Carolina Department

of Agriculture and Consumer Services

#### UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY ATLANTA, GEORGIA

In the Matter of:	)	CLERK :	
Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc.	)	Docket No. FIFRA-04-2009-9105(b)	
Respondent.	) ) )		

#### CONSENT AGREEMENT AND FINAL ORDER

#### I. Nature of the Action

- 1. This is a civil penalty proceeding pursuant to Section 14(a) of the Federal Insecticide,
  Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act, as amended, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a) (hereinafter "FIFRA"),
  and pursuant to the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing Administrative Assessment
  of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits
  (Consolidated Rules), 40 CFR Part 22. Complainant is the Director of the Air, Pesticides,
  and Toxics Management Division, United States Environmental Protection Agency,
  Region 4 (EPA). Respondent is Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc.
- 2. Complainant and Respondent have conferred for the purpose of settlement pursuant to 40 CFR § 22.18 and desire to resolve this matter and settle the allegations described herein without a formal hearing. Therefore, without the taking of any evidence or testimony, the making of any argument, or the adjudication of any issue in this matter, and in accordance with 40 CFR § 22.13(b), this Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO) will simultaneously commence and conclude this matter.

#### II. Preliminary Statements

- 3. The authority to take action under Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a), is vested in the Administrator of EPA. The Administrator of EPA has delegated this authority under FIFRA to EPA Region 4 by EPA Delegation 5-14 dated May 11, 1994.
- 4. Pursuant to 40 CFR § 22.5(c)(4) the following individual represents EPA in this matter and is authorized to receive service for EPA in this proceeding:

Cheryn L. Jones Pesticides Management Section U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960 (404) 562-9006.

#### III. Specific Allegations

- Respondent is Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc., incorporated in the State of Delaware, and doing business in North Carolina, and Respondent is located at 410 S. Swing Road, Greensboro, NC 27409.
- 6. Respondent is a "person" as defined by Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(s), in that it is a corporation, and as such is subject to FIFRA and the regulations promulgated thereunder.
- 7. Respondent is a "registrant" as defined by Section 2(y) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(y) in that it is a person who has registered pesticides pursuant to the provisions of FIFRA.
- 8. Respondent is a "producer" as defined by Section 2(w) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(w), in that it is a person who manufacturers, prepares, compounds, propagates, or processes any pesticide.

- 9. "Pesticide" is defined by Section 2(u) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(u), to mean any substance or mixture of substances intended for preventing, destroying, repelling, or mitigating any pest.
- 10. Respondent produces pesticides "to distribute or sell" as that term is defined by Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §136(gg), in that the pesticides are held for distribution, held for sale, held for shipment, shipped, delivered for shipment, released for shipment or received and (having so received) delivered or offered to deliver.
- 11. On or about May 8, 2008, Respondent discovered violations of Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(E), during an internal meeting, relating to two pesticides registered to Respondent: Abamectin Technical, EPA Reg. No. 100-895, and Abamectin Technical II, EPA Reg. No. 100-1259.
- 12. Respondent discovered that employees at Respondent's independent distribution warehouse, Nickey, had applied labels for Abamectin Technical, EPA Reg. No. 100-895, to containers of the Abamectin Technical II, EPA Reg. No. 100-1259. Respondent had inadvertently failed to supply Abamectin Technical II labels to Nickey employees.
- 13. Respondent voluntarily disclosed the violations in writing to EPA Region 4 by letter dated June 4, 2008.
- 14. The self-disclosed violations consist of eight shipments of Abamectin Technical II, EPA Reg. No. 100-1259, with the label for Abamectin Technical, EPA Reg. No. 100-895, affixed to the containers.
- 15. According to Section 2(q)(1)(C) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(q)(1)(C), a pesticide is misbranded if it is an imitation of, or offered for sale under the name of, another pesticide.

- 16. Under Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(E), it is unlawful for any person in any State to distribute or sell to any person any registered pesticide which is misbranded.
- 17. Respondent violated Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(E), on at least eight separate occasions and is therefore subject to the assessment of civil penalties under Section 14 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l.
- 18. After consideration of the factors set forth in Section 14(a)(4) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a)(4), EPA proposes to assess a total civil penalty of THIRTY-ONE THOUSAND TWO HUNDRED DOLLARS (\$31,200) against the Respondent for the above-described violations. Civil penalties under Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a), may be assessed by Administrative Order.

#### IV. Consent Agreement

- 19. For the purposes of this CAFO, Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations set forth above and neither admits nor denies the factual allegations.
- 20. Respondent waives its right to a hearing on the allegations contained herein and its right to appeal the proposed final order accompanying the consent agreement.
- 21. Respondent consents to the assessment of the penalty proposed by EPA and agrees to pay the civil penalty as set forth in this CAFO.
- 22. Respondent certifies that as of the date of its execution of this CAFO, it is in compliance with all relevant requirements of FIFRA.
- 23. Compliance with this CAFO shall resolve the allegations of the violations contained herein. This CAFO shall not otherwise affect any liability of Respondent to the United States. Other than as expressed herein, neither EPA nor Complainant waives any right to

bring an enforcement action against Respondent for violation of any federal or state statute, regulation or permit, to initiate an action for imminent and substantial endangerment, or to pursue criminal enforcement.

24. Complainant and Respondent agree to settle this matter by their execution of this CAFO.
The parties agree that the settlement of this matter is in the public interest and that this
CAFO is consistent with the applicable requirements of FIFRA.

#### V. Final Order

- 25. Respondent is assessed a civil penalty of THIRTY-ONE THOUSAND TWO HUNDRED DOLLARS (\$31,200) which shall be paid within 30 days from the effective date of this CAFO.
- 26. Respondent shall remit the penalty by either a cashier's or certified check made payable to the "Treasurer, United States of America," and shall send the check via U.S. mail to the following address:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center P.O. Box 979077 St. Louis, MO 63197-9000.

The check shall reference on its face the name of the Respondent and the Docket Number of the CAFO.

27. At the time of payment, Respondent shall send a separate copy of the check and a written statement that the payment is being made in accordance with this CAFO, to the following persons at the following addresses:

Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street, S.W. Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960; Cheryn L. Jones
Pesticides Management Section
U.S. EPA - Region 4
61 Forsyth Street
Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960; and

Saundi Wilson Office of Environmental U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960.

- 28. For the purposes of state and federal income taxation, Respondent shall not be entitled, and agrees not to attempt, to claim a deduction for any civil penalty payment made pursuant to this CAFO. Any attempt by Respondent to deduct any such payments shall constitute a violation of this CAFO.
- 29. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717, EPA is entitled to assess interest and penalties on debts owed to the United States and a charge to cover the cost of processing and handling a delinquent claim. Interest will therefore begin to accrue on the civil penalty from the date of entry of this CAFO, if the penalty is not paid by the date required. A charge will also be assessed to cover the administrative costs, both direct and indirect, of overdue debts. In addition, a late payment penalty charge shall be applied on any principal amount not paid within 90 days of the due date.
- 30. Complainant and Respondent shall bear their own costs and attorney fees in this matter.
- 31. This CAFO shall be binding upon the Respondent, its successors and assigns.
- 32. The undersigned representative of the party to this CAFO certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the party represented to enter into this CAFO and legally binds that party to this CAFO.

By: Vincort Alventos-(Typed or Printed)  Date:	August 14, 2009
Title: Sr. Corporate and Royula For Courses (Typed or Printed)	
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency	
By: Free A. Spage Carol L. Kemker, Acting Director Air, Pesticides and Toxics Management Division 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960	9/11/09
APPROVED AND SO ORDERED this day of	<u>r-</u> 200 <u>9</u> .
Susan B. Schub Regional Judicial Officer	

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have this day served a true and correct copy of the foregoing Consent Agreement and Final Order, in the Matter of: Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc., FIFRA Docket No. FIFRA-04-2009-9105(b), on the parties listed below in the manner indicated.

Cheryn L. Jones 4APT-PTSB Pesticides Management Section U.S. EPA - Region 4 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, GA 30303-8960 (404) 562-9006 (Via EPA's internal mail)

Michiko Kono
Office of Environmental Accountability
U.S. EPA - Region 4
61 Forsyth Street
Atlanta, GA 30303-8960
(404) 562-9558

(Via EPA's internal mail)

Vincent Alventosa, Senior Corporate and Regulatory Counsel Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc. 410 South Swing Road Greensboro, NC 27409-2080

\_

(Via Certified Mail - Return Receipt Requested)

Date: 4 - 17 - 09

Patricia A. Bullock, Regional Hearing Clerk

United States Environmental Protection Agency, Region 4 Sam Nunn Atlanta Federal Center 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, GA 30303-8960

(404) 562-9511

### EPA ACCOUNTS RECEIVABLE CONTROL NUMBER FORM

TO BE	COMPLETED BY THE ORIGINATIN	G OFFICE	<u>:</u> :		
(Att	ach a copy of the final order and transmittal	letter to Dei	endant/R	espondent)	
This for	n was originated by:			D	D
112010		(N	ame)		(Date)
in <b>the</b> _	Region 4, ORC, OEA			at (4	<b>04) 562-</b> 9504
	(Offic	æ) <sub>(</sub>		(Te	dephone Number)
	Non-SF Judicial Order/Consent Decree USAO COLLECTS			Administrative Order/Cons FMO COLLECTS PAYMI	
	SF Judicial Order/Consent Decree DOJ COLLECTS			Oversight Billing - Cost Pac Sent with bill	ckage required:
				Not sent with bill	
	Other Receivable		$\overline{\Box}$	Oversight Billing - Cost Pac	kage not required
	This is an original debt			This is a modification	
PAYEE		Prof	ection	y making the payment)	
	(Availie of person and/or	Company/M	micibani	y making the payment)	
The Tot	tal Dollar Amount of the Receivable: \$	31,200	<u> </u>		
	(If installments, attach schedule of	•	_		of this form.)
The Car	se Docket Number:F F 2	A OU	2000	1 9105(6)	
		<del></del>			
The Site	e Specific Superfund Account Number:				
The Des	signated Regional/Headquarters Program Off	ice:			
			* - 7-		
	<u> </u>			<u></u> ;	
The IES	MS Accounts Receivable Control Number is:			Date	
I DC IL	VIS ACCOUNTS RECEIVABLE COMMON Number 18.				
If you h	ave any questions, please call:	of the l	inancial i	Management Section at:	. <u> </u>
		_			
DICTOR	DITTION.				
	BUTION:				
	<u>VICIAL ORDERS</u> ; Copies of this form with an attac ald be mailed to:	ched copy of t	the front pa	age of the <u>FINAL JUDICIAL O</u>	RDER
1.	Debt Tracking Officer Environmental Enforcement Section	2. 3.		ng Office (EAD)	
	Department of Justice RM 1647 P.O. Box 7611, Benjamin Franklin Station Washington, D.C. 20044	3.	Designate	d Program Office	
R. ADA	Winistrative Orders: Copies of this form wi	ith an attache	d copy of t	he front page of the Administrat	ive Order should be s
. —	<del></del>				are orone subunit of the
1.	Originating Office	3.	Designate	d Program Office	